

# What the Movement Made

## Long-Term Impacts of Civil Resistance Campaigns

Jonathan Pinckney

UT Dallas

APSA 2023







The "Arab Spring" fails



The "Carnation Revolution"  
endures

What effects of civil resistance campaigns endure over the long term and why?

# We know that violent conflict has major long-term effects

- Extensive literature on a variety of social and political consequences (Price and Yaylaci 2021)
  - Major economic effects (Collier 1999, Costalli et al 2017, de Groot et al 2022)
  - Significant harm to public health (Ghobarah et al 2003, Saing and Kazinga 2020)
  - Big changes to political behavior (Blattman 2009, Costalli and Ruggeri 2019)

# We know that violent conflict has major long-term effects

- Extensive literature on a variety of social and political consequences (Price and Yaylaci 2021)
  - Major economic effects (Collier 1999, Costalli et al 2017, de Groot et al 2022)
  - Significant harm to public health (Ghobarah et al 2003, Saing and Kazinga 2020)
  - Big changes to political behavior (Blattman 2009, Costalli and Ruggeri 2019)

# We know that violent conflict has major long-term effects

- Extensive literature on a variety of social and political consequences (Price and Yaylaci 2021)
  - Major economic effects (Collier 1999, Costalli et al 2017, de Groot et al 2022)
  - Significant harm to public health (Ghobarah et al 2003, Saing and Kazinga 2020)
  - Big changes to political behavior (Blattman 2009, Costalli and Ruggeri 2019)

# We know that violent conflict has major long-term effects

- Extensive literature on a variety of social and political consequences (Price and Yaylaci 2021)
  - Major economic effects (Collier 1999, Costalli et al 2017, de Groot et al 2022)
  - Significant harm to public health (Ghobarah et al 2003, Saing and Kazinga 2020)
  - Big changes to political behavior (Blattman 2009, Costalli and Ruggeri 2019)



# What about long-term effects of nonviolent conflict?

- Very little research on effects generally
- The exception is democratization
  - Most focus on short to medium term (Bethke and Pinckney 2021, Chenoweth and Stephan 2011, Celestino and Gleditsch 2013, Pinckney 2020)
  - But some evidence of long-term democracy effect in Africa (García-Peña and Wantchekon 2023)
- What about other effects?
- No substantive research on long-term impacts of civil resistance across cases and variables

# What about long-term effects of nonviolent conflict?

- Very little research on effects generally
- The exception is democratization
  - Most focus on short to medium term (Bethke and Pinckney 2021, Chenoweth and Stephan 2011, Celestino and Gleditsch 2013, Pinckney 2020)
  - But some evidence of long-term democracy effect in Africa (Garcia-Ponce and Wantchekon 2023)
- What about other effects?
- No substantive research on long-term impacts of civil resistance across cases and variables

# What about long-term effects of nonviolent conflict?

- Very little research on effects generally
- The exception is democratization
  - Most focus on short to medium term (Bethke and Pinckney 2021, Chenoweth and Stephan 2011, Celestino and Gleditsch 2013, Pinckney 2020)
  - But some evidence of long-term democracy effect in Africa (Garcia-Ponce and Wantchekon 2023)
- What about other effects?
  - “How long does it take to see the effects of nonviolent conflict?”
  - “What are the values that long-term impacts in civil resistance?”
  - “How do we measure the effects of nonviolent conflict?”
  - Individual “biographical consequences” but shifted mostly to development-democracy (Przeworski et al 2001)
- No substantive research on long-term impacts of civil resistance across cases and variables

# What about long-term effects of nonviolent conflict?

- Very little research on effects generally
- The exception is democratization
  - Most focus on short to medium term (Bethke and Pinckney 2021, Chenoweth and Stephan 2011, Celestino and Gleditsch 2013, Pinckney 2020)
  - But some evidence of long-term democracy effect in Africa (Garcia-Ponce and Wantchekon 2023)
- What about other effects?
  - Modest improvement in life expectancy ten years after campaign (Stoddard 2013)
  - Qualitative literature finds long-term impacts in specific cases (Dale Porto et al 2018, Fernandes 2015)
  - Individual “long-term” consequences? but little research in this area (Garcia-Ponce, Przeworski et al 2021)
- No substantive research on long-term impacts of civil resistance across cases and variables

# What about long-term effects of nonviolent conflict?

- Very little research on effects generally
- The exception is democratization
  - Most focus on short to medium term (Bethke and Pinckney 2021, Chenoweth and Stephan 2011, Celestino and Gleditsch 2013, Pinckney 2020)
  - But some evidence of long-term democracy effect in Africa (Garcia-Ponce and Wantchekon 2023)
- What about other effects?
  - Modest improvement in life expectancy ten years after campaign (Stoddard 2013)
  - Qualitative literature finds long-term impacts in specific cases (Della Porta et al 2018, Fernandes 2015)
  - Individual “biographical consequences” but studied mostly in developed democracies (Vestergren et al 2017)
- No substantive research on long-term impacts of civil resistance across cases and variables

# What about long-term effects of nonviolent conflict?

- Very little research on effects generally
- The exception is democratization
  - Most focus on short to medium term (Bethke and Pinckney 2021, Chenoweth and Stephan 2011, Celestino and Gleditsch 2013, Pinckney 2020)
  - But some evidence of long-term democracy effect in Africa (Garcia-Ponce and Wantchekon 2023)
- What about other effects?
  - Modest improvement in life expectancy ten years after campaign (Stoddard 2013)
  - Qualitative literature finds long-term impacts in specific cases (Della Porta et al 2018, Fernandes 2015)
  - Individual “biographical consequences” but studied mostly in developed democracies (Vestergren et al 2017)
- No substantive research on long-term impacts of civil resistance across cases and variables

# What about long-term effects of nonviolent conflict?

- Very little research on effects generally
- The exception is democratization
  - Most focus on short to medium term (Bethke and Pinckney 2021, Chenoweth and Stephan 2011, Celestino and Gleditsch 2013, Pinckney 2020)
  - But some evidence of long-term democracy effect in Africa (Garcia-Ponce and Wantchekon 2023)
- What about other effects?
  - Modest improvement in life expectancy ten years after campaign (Stoddard 2013)
  - Qualitative literature finds long-term impacts in specific cases (Della Porta et al 2018, Fernandes 2015)
  - Individual “biographical consequences” but studied mostly in developed democracies (Vestergren et al 2017)
- No substantive research on long-term impacts of civil resistance across cases and variables

# What about long-term effects of nonviolent conflict?

- Very little research on effects generally
- The exception is democratization
  - Most focus on short to medium term (Bethke and Pinckney 2021, Chenoweth and Stephan 2011, Celestino and Gleditsch 2013, Pinckney 2020)
  - But some evidence of long-term democracy effect in Africa (Garcia-Ponce and Wantchekon 2023)
- What about other effects?
  - Modest improvement in life expectancy ten years after campaign (Stoddard 2013)
  - Qualitative literature finds long-term impacts in specific cases (Della Porta et al 2018, Fernandes 2015)
  - Individual “biographical consequences” but studied mostly in developed democracies (Vestergren et al 2017)
- No substantive research on long-term impacts of civil resistance across cases and variables



# What about long-term effects of nonviolent conflict?

- Very little research on effects generally
- The exception is democratization
  - Most focus on short to medium term (Bethke and Pinckney 2021, Chenoweth and Stephan 2011, Celestino and Gleditsch 2013, Pinckney 2020)
  - But some evidence of long-term democracy effect in Africa (Garcia-Ponce and Wantchekon 2023)
- What about other effects?
  - Modest improvement in life expectancy ten years after campaign (Stoddard 2013)
  - Qualitative literature finds long-term impacts in specific cases (Della Porta et al 2018, Fernandes 2015)
  - Individual “biographical consequences” but studied mostly in developed democracies (Vestergren et al 2017)
- No substantive research on long-term impacts of civil resistance across cases and variables

# How Civil Resistance Endures

- Maximalist civil resistance campaigns are a critical juncture that reshapes institutions, culture, and relationships in an “inversion of hierarchies.” (Fishman 2011, Tarrow 1993)
- What would enable that reshaping to endure?
  - Institutional lock-in
  - Attitudes and memories transmitted across generations (Mazower 2018)
  - Reorganization of institutions (e.g., 1980s American South)
  - New forms of civil resistance (e.g., 2011 Arab Spring)

# How Civil Resistance Endures

- Maximalist civil resistance campaigns are a critical juncture that reshapes institutions, culture, and relationships in an “inversion of hierarchies.” (Fishman 2011, Tarrow 1993)
- What would enable that reshaping to endure?
  - Institutional lock-in
  - Attitudes and memories transmitted across generations (Mazumder 2018)
  - Repertoires of contention (Tilly 1986, Ekiert and Kubik 2001)
  - Reshaped social networks and increased social trust

# How Civil Resistance Endures

- Maximalist civil resistance campaigns are a critical juncture that reshapes institutions, culture, and relationships in an “inversion of hierarchies.” (Fishman 2011, Tarrow 1993)
- What would enable that reshaping to endure?
  - Institutional lock-in
  - Attitudes and memories transmitted across generations (Mazumder 2018)
  - Repertoires of contention (Tilly 1986, Ekiert and Kubik 2001)
  - Reshaped social networks and increased social trust

# How Civil Resistance Endures

- Maximalist civil resistance campaigns are a critical juncture that reshapes institutions, culture, and relationships in an “inversion of hierarchies.” (Fishman 2011, Tarrow 1993)
- What would enable that reshaping to endure?
  - Institutional lock-in
  - Attitudes and memories transmitted across generations (Mazumder 2018)
  - Repertoires of contention (Tilly 1986, Ekiert and Kubik 2001)
  - Reshaped social networks and increased social trust

# How Civil Resistance Endures

- Maximalist civil resistance campaigns are a critical juncture that reshapes institutions, culture, and relationships in an “inversion of hierarchies.” (Fishman 2011, Tarrow 1993)
- What would enable that reshaping to endure?
  - Institutional lock-in
  - Attitudes and memories transmitted across generations (Mazumder 2018)
  - Repertoires of contention (Tilly 1986, Ekiert and Kubik 2001)
  - Reshaped social networks and increased social trust

# How Civil Resistance Endures

- Maximalist civil resistance campaigns are a critical juncture that reshapes institutions, culture, and relationships in an “inversion of hierarchies.” (Fishman 2011, Tarrow 1993)
- What would enable that reshaping to endure?
  - Institutional lock-in
  - Attitudes and memories transmitted across generations (Mazumder 2018)
  - Repertoires of contention (Tilly 1986, Ekiert and Kubik 2001)
  - Reshaped social networks and increased social trust

# What Civil Resistance Impacts

- **Public health (Stoddard 2013)**
  - Increased political efficacy and social capital reducing prevalence of some mental health conditions (Hope et al 2018, Ni et al 2020, Ayinde et al 2021)
  - Greater public expenditure on health due to diffusion of power
- Economics
  - Increased government accountability and reduced corruption
  - Others?



# What Civil Resistance Impacts

- Public health (Stoddard 2013)
  - Increased political efficacy and social capital reducing prevalence of some mental health conditions (Hope et al 2018, Ni et al 2020, Ayinde et al 2021)
  - Greater public expenditure on health due to diffusion of power
- Economics
  - Don't expect major impact on economic growth
  - But potential effects reducing economic inequality
- Increased government accountability and reduced corruption
- Others?

# What Civil Resistance Impacts

- Public health (Stoddard 2013)
  - Increased political efficacy and social capital reducing prevalence of some mental health conditions (Hope et al 2018, Ni et al 2020, Ayinde et al 2021)
  - Greater public expenditure on health due to diffusion of power
- Economics
  - Don't expect major impact on economic growth
  - But potential effects reducing economic inequality
- Increased government accountability and reduced corruption
- Others?

# What Civil Resistance Impacts

- Public health (Stoddard 2013)
  - Increased political efficacy and social capital reducing prevalence of some mental health conditions (Hope et al 2018, Ni et al 2020, Ayinde et al 2021)
  - Greater public expenditure on health due to diffusion of power
- Economics
  - Don't expect major impact on economic growth
  - But potential effects reducing economic inequality
- Increased government accountability and reduced corruption
- Others?

# What Civil Resistance Impacts

- Public health (Stoddard 2013)
  - Increased political efficacy and social capital reducing prevalence of some mental health conditions (Hope et al 2018, Ni et al 2020, Ayinde et al 2021)
  - Greater public expenditure on health due to diffusion of power
- Economics
  - Don't expect major impact on economic growth
  - But potential effects reducing economic inequality
- Increased government accountability and reduced corruption
- Others?

# What Civil Resistance Impacts

- Public health (Stoddard 2013)
  - Increased political efficacy and social capital reducing prevalence of some mental health conditions (Hope et al 2018, Ni et al 2020, Ayinde et al 2021)
  - Greater public expenditure on health due to diffusion of power
- Economics
  - Don't expect major impact on economic growth
  - But potential effects reducing economic inequality
- Increased government accountability and reduced corruption
- Others?

# What Civil Resistance Impacts

- Public health (Stoddard 2013)
  - Increased political efficacy and social capital reducing prevalence of some mental health conditions (Hope et al 2018, Ni et al 2020, Ayinde et al 2021)
  - Greater public expenditure on health due to diffusion of power
- Economics
  - Don't expect major impact on economic growth
  - But potential effects reducing economic inequality
- Increased government accountability and reduced corruption
- Others?

# What Civil Resistance Impacts

- Public health (Stoddard 2013)
  - Increased political efficacy and social capital reducing prevalence of some mental health conditions (Hope et al 2018, Ni et al 2020, Ayinde et al 2021)
  - Greater public expenditure on health due to diffusion of power
- Economics
  - Don't expect major impact on economic growth
  - But potential effects reducing economic inequality
- Increased government accountability and reduced corruption
- Others?

# Levels of Analysis

- I expect effects across three levels of analysis
  - 1 Cross-national: Countries with CR campaigns  $\neq$  countries w/o CR campaign
  - 2 Sub-national: Localities with significant CR activity  $\neq$  localities w/o significant CR activity
  - 3 Individual: participants and their families  $\neq$  non-participants and their families



# Levels of Analysis

- I expect effects across three levels of analysis
  - 1 Cross-national: Countries with CR campaigns  $\neq$  countries w/o CR campaign
  - 2 Sub-national: Localities with significant CR activity  $\neq$  localities w/o significant CR activity
  - 3 Individual: participants and their families  $\neq$  non-participants and their families

# Levels of Analysis

- I expect effects across three levels of analysis
  - 1 Cross-national: Countries with CR campaigns  $\neq$  countries w/o CR campaign
  - 2 Sub-national: Localities with significant CR activity  $\neq$  localities w/o significant CR activity
  - 3 Individual: participants and their families  $\neq$  non-participants and their families

# Levels of Analysis

- I expect effects across three levels of analysis
  - ① Cross-national: Countries with CR campaigns  $\neq$  countries w/o CR campaign
  - ② Sub-national: Localities with significant CR activity  $\neq$  localities w/o significant CR activity
  - ③ Individual: participants and their families  $\neq$  non-participants and their families

# Cross-National Analysis

- NAVCO 1.3: 320 nonviolent campaigns from 1900 - 2019
- DVs from WHO, World Bank, V-Dem
- Interrupted time series or diff-in-diff designs

# Cross-National Analysis

- NAVCO 1.3: 320 nonviolent campaigns from 1900 - 2019
- DVs from WHO, World Bank, V-Dem
- Interrupted time series or diff-in-diff designs

# Cross-National Analysis

- NAVCO 1.3: 320 nonviolent campaigns from 1900 - 2019
- DVs from WHO, World Bank, V-Dem
- Interrupted time series or diff-in-diff designs

# Potential Countries for Sub-National Analysis



Gandhi in India



Nkrumah in Ghana

# Individual-Level Analysis

- Surveys comparing children of participants with non-participants
- Examine political activism, self-efficacy, life satisfaction, mental health



# Individual-Level Analysis

- Surveys comparing children of participants with non-participants
- Examine political activism, self-efficacy, life satisfaction, mental health

# Outstanding Questions

- What are the strengths and weaknesses of this project?
- What questions am I not asking that I should be asking?
- Are there other countries I should be thinking about for sub-national and individual analysis?

# Outstanding Questions

- What are the strengths and weaknesses of this project?
- What questions am I not asking that I should be asking?
- Are there other countries I should be thinking about for sub-national and individual analysis?

# Outstanding Questions

- What are the strengths and weaknesses of this project?
- What questions am I not asking that I should be asking?
- Are there other countries I should be thinking about for sub-national and individual analysis?

# Thank you!

[jonathan.pinckney@utdallas.edu](mailto:jonathan.pinckney@utdallas.edu)

